

Journal of
Economics and Political Economy

www.ijepe.com

Volume1

September 2014

Issue 1

**Internationalization of post-Soviet Economists:
Evidence from Central Asia and the Caucasus**

By Murat ÇOKGEZEN* and Jale ÇOKGEZEN**

Abstract. After the collapse of socialism, post-Soviet republics reorganized economics curricula, published new textbooks, and trained students and academics in their home countries or in the West. How did these efforts change the quantity and quality of international publications of post-Soviet economists? The results of this study show that the number of international publications increased gradually. These publications usually concern regional issues and are published in low impact journals. The preference of Russian language journals implies that language is a barrier to publish in international journals. Cooperation with Westerners is found to contribute positively to their publication performance.

Keywords. Transition, economics education, Caucasus, Central Asia, Publication performance.

JEL Class. A10, P27.

1. Introduction

Intervening in virtually all aspects of the citizens' life, the socialist regime that held power in the Soviet Union until 1989 restricted the flow of ideas, both into and out of the country. In those days, Soviet academics had limited access to the works of their Western counterparts due to formal and informal restrictions.ⁱ The reverse was also true.ⁱⁱ Even though the formal/legal restrictions on publishing in the West were not too severe, works produced by Soviet academics rarely found international outlets, either because of the preference to produce for the domestic market or because of an inability to produce works that met the basic requirements of the international outlets, related not only to a lack of proficiency in English but also to methodological differences between Soviet and Western economics.

After the collapse of Soviet Union at the end of the 1980s, new republics sprung up on the former Soviet land. These republics abandoned socialist ideals and adopted new political and economic models closer, more or less, to capitalist values. They lifted most of the barriers on the flow of ideas, established closer contacts with other parts of the world and replaced old institutions with new ones that were more compatible with the West. This leads us to ask whether their visibility in international outlets has increased since then. Have the quality and quantity of their works published in the outside world changed? What are the venues and characteristics of these publications? Aiming to provide some answers

* Corresponding author, Marmara University, Department of Economics, Göztepe Campus 34722 Kuyubaşı, İstanbul-Turkey. +902165414021/1526. mcokgezen@marmara.edu.tr

** Marmara University, Department of Economics, Göztepe Campus 34722, Kuyubaşı, İstanbul-Turkey. jpala@marmara.edu.tr

Journal of Economics and Political Economy

to these questions, this study examines articles published by Central Asian and Caucasian (CAC) economists' in international economics journals.

Stretching from the eastern shore of the Black Sea to China, the Central Asia and Caucasus region includes eight former Soviet republics: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan, and Tajikistan. After the collapse of Soviet Union these countries generally followed a slower reform path than the many other former socialist countries. Among them, of course, there were also differences. In Central Asia, while Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan moved relatively fast in adopting structural reforms, Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan, and Tajikistan lagged behind. In the Caucasus region, meanwhile, Georgia and Armenia were fast in adopting reforms, faster even than many of the other post-Soviet countries, while Azerbaijan lagged behind.ⁱⁱⁱ

Despite their many differences, the new, independent countries in the CAC have much in common because of their shared history as former Soviet republics. In all of these countries, despite the regime changes, institutions and working practices inherited from the Soviet era continue to exist, albeit under different names and at different levels of significance. They still have close ties with each other and other former republics.^{iv} Russian also remains the common language of these republics, both in academia, certainly in science, and in daily life.^v However, due to the different transition paths followed after independence, the level of integration into the wider world was different for each country.

In spite of reforms undertaken after independence, the influence of the previous regime still persists in the higher education systems of CAC countries. Higher education in the Soviet Union was highly ideological, shaped by the requirements of the socialist state. Contact between Soviet academics and their Western counterparts and the communication of ideas were restricted since these were considered harmful to the Soviet order. In natural and formal sciences, in which a scholar needs mathematical rather than linguistic proficiency and little or no ideological involvement, Soviet and Western academics were more aware of one another's work than in the social sciences, where English language proficiency and ideology are critical.

In the field of economics, for instance, almost all Soviet economists had been brought up and educated in an environment dominated by socialist/communist values and thus had almost no idea about the agenda of their Western counterparts. Those who were curious to learn had to overcome language and other barriers, formal and informal, before being able to access this knowledge. After the collapse of the Soviet Union and adoption of the prevailing capitalist economic model, the frame of reference that academics had inherited from the old regime became insufficient, requiring that they be retrained in accordance with the needs of new model. These characteristics also make economics an interesting area to investigate in this context.

This study will examine the trends in publications of CAC economists in international economics journals. Even though it is limited to a region (CAC) and a specific field (economics), the results can be applied to the other former Soviet republics and other fields.

2. Transformation of economics education in CAC^{vi}

Economics education in the Soviet Union was entirely different from that of the West. Economics students were taught in Marxism, history of the Communist Party, and a combination of socialism and marginalism known as 'System of optimal functioning of socialist economy'; they were unaware of the basic topics that comprised the economics curriculum of the West, like firm theory, public

Journal of Economics and Political Economy

choice, and utility function. They and their teachers had very limited access to the works of Western economists.

Academic economists in the Soviet Union basically concentrated on two main fields: political economy and mathematical economics.^{vii} Political economy, the field in which the vast majority of soviet economists worked, was a highly political discipline explaining economic issues through Marxist-Leninist ideology in a historically oriented and descriptive way. Mathematical economics was a less ideological but highly technical discipline, generally taught in a separate division of economics departments, using elaborate mathematical techniques and few verbal explanations. Despite the methodological shortcomings in both of these areas, mathematical economists were admired more by the Western world. They had better contacts with Western economists and their works. Some of their works were translated into English or published in prestigious journals. One even won a Nobel Prize.^{viii}

Even though the restrictions on Western economic thought were relaxed and some of the works of pro-market economists, like Friedrich August Hayek and Milton Friedman, had been translated into Russian in the late 1980s, the major transformation occurred after the dissolution of the Soviet Union in 1991. After the adoption of private property and market mechanisms in the new republics that emerged on the lands of the former Soviet Union, there arose an urgent need for a reform in economics education, adjusted to the new regime, and for new economists, equipped to meet the needs of the new system. In order to meet these needs, broadly similar steps were taken in post-socialist national governments in cooperation with foreign country governments, NGOs, and aid programs (Kirtchik, 2012; Silova and Steiner-Khamsi, 2008).

The basic reform package in almost all of these countries included reorganization of curricula, introduction of new standards in student assessments, decentralization and privatization of higher education, privatization and liberalization of textbook publishing, and reorganization of schools. Foreign partners provided financial and technical assistance to train students and academics in the home country or in the West, publish new books, and re-organize schools and programs. In this regard, grant and fellowship programs were initiated, joint graduate and exchange programs created, and new educational and research centers built (Kirtchik, 2012). Not all countries welcomed the foreign assistance. Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan followed more nationalistic policies. Turkmenistan, in particular, refused outside help and rejected any kind of foreign intervention in its education system (Silova and Steiner-Khamsi, 2008).

Despite the efforts to transform both individuals and institutions in the region, a total shift from the old order was not to be expected. While the number of new generation economists equipped for the market system grew both in domestic institutions and abroad, the old Soviet-style professors continued to hold key positions in government bodies and government universities in all post-Soviet countries. These institutions were characterized by poor quality teachers, little incentive for research, and low standards for graduation, recruitment, and promotion (Androushak and Yudkevich, 2012; Pleskovic et al., 2002; Kirtchik, 2012; Coupe, 2008). This was the case even among the fast reformers of the region, while it was worse in more isolated and nationalistic Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan or poor Tajikistan (Pleskovic et al. 2002; Androushak and Yudkevich, 2012).

Newer universities and research institutions, established in the post-Soviet era, are more competitive and dynamic and generally more promising institutions (Pleskovic et al., 2002). These institutions were typically established in partnership with foreign institutions and financed by international NGOs, foundations, and

local governments. They mostly hire Western educated locals or foreign staff and provide Western style education, usually in English, and more incentives and opportunities for research than the old, state institutions. Every country in the region has one or more of these institutions, like The Kazakhstan Institute of Management, Economics, and Strategic Research (KIMEP) in Kazakhstan, The American University of Central Asia in Kyrgyzstan, Westminster International University in Uzbekistan, International School of Economics at Tbilisi State University (ISET) and Georgian-American University in Georgia, American University of Armenia in Armenia, and Quafqaz University in Azerbaijan. Studies examining international publications of former socialist countries' economists found that those economists holding a PhD degree from abroad and then participating in one of these new institutions in their countries make major contributions to their countries' publication performance (Kirtchik, 2012; Coupe, 2008; Munich, 2006).

3. International publications of CAC economists

Researchers disseminate their scholarly output through publications in books, journal articles, and thesis form. In bibliometric studies, however, 'publication' usually refers solely to journal articles. This is due to a lack of (1) data sources that provide easy access to other publication types, and (2) widely accepted evaluation criteria for works other than articles. The present study, therefore, also counted only journal articles as 'publications'. *Scopus* database has been used to collect information on articles published by Central Asian and Caucasian economists between January 1, 1990 and December 31, 2013.

Scopus is a bibliographic database owned by international publisher Elsevier and covering about 20,000 journals across various disciplines. A search was performed for all Scopus-indexed articles in economics journals by writers affiliated to an institution in one of the eight CAC countries. Therefore, first, the articles published by a researcher affiliated to a CAC institution are considered, even when s/he is a foreign national. Second, since the article is published in an economics journal, the author is considered an 'economist', regardless of whether s/he is or is not, in fact, an economist by profession or education. Third, since several general interest social science journals are also listed among the Scopus economics journals, the search results gave some articles about topics barely related to economics. Considering both the problems of eliminating these articles and also their very limited number, we treated them as economics articles. Hence, the study results presented here should be evaluated within these limitations.

TABLE 1. *Number of publications by country, pre-2000 and 2000–2013*

Country	Kazakhstan	Kyrgyzstan	Tajikistan	Turkmenistan	Uzbekistan	Armenia	Georgia	Azerbaijan	Total
2013	49	1	1		5	1	3	8	68
2012	59	1	1		5	1	2	4	73
2011	6		1	1			1	7	16
2010	5		1		1	1	3	2	13
2009	3	2					6		11
2008	7	2				1			10

Journal of Economics and Political Economy

Country	Kazakhstan	Kyrgyzstan	Tajikistan	Turkmenistan	Uzbekistan	Armenia	Georgia	Azerbaijan	Total
2007	3	1	1		2	2	1		10
2006	7					3			10
2005	3	1	2			2	2		10
2004	1			1			1		3
2003	1	1			1		1		4
2002		1			1		1		3
2001					3		1		4
2000	2	1	1		4		1		9
Pre-2000	0	1	0	0	1	0	1	1	4
Total	146	12	8	2	23	11	25	15	248

Using the abovementioned method, we found 248 publications produced by CAC economists between 1990 and 2013 (Table 1). Throughout this period, it is apparent, the number of publications grew. While only four publications were found for the pre-2000 period, the *annual* average number of publications for the following five-year period rose to slightly above four and jumped to over 10 in 2005, after which it continued to rise. The number finally hit 73 in 2012.^{ix} The major contribution (about 59 percent) was made by the economists of Kazakhstan, the largest and wealthiest country of the region, while Turkmenistan, the most isolated country in the region, contributed the least (less than one percent). Tajikistan, the poorest country of the region, also made very minor contribution (about 3.2 percent).

Table 2 in appendix shows the distribution of articles by journal. The most prominent feature in this list is the dominance of “Actual Problems of Economics” (APE) among journals. First listed by Scopus in 2011, this journal remains the only Scopus-listed economics journal accepting articles in Russian (in addition to English). With the inclusion of APE, the number of published articles jumped from 16 to 72; some 38 percent of the total 248 articles were published in this journal.

Issue of language (English) as a publishing barrier in international journals is discussed in many studies (for instance, García Landa, 2006; Çokgezen, 2013; Kirtchick, 2012). Particularly, Kirtchick(2012) indicate that during the 1990s, more than a half of the articles published by Russian economists appeared in *Problems of Economic Transition*, the journal which is printing English translations of papers originally published in Russian. The special attention of CAC economists to APE can be explained by the comfort for the economists of expressing themselves in Russian, the lingua franca of the region.

The second point to make about the journal list is to note the preponderance of regional journals, like “Asian Social Science”, “Economics of Transition”, “Eurasian (formerly “Post-Soviet”) Geography and Economics”, and “Europe-Asia Studies”, along with the journals peripheral to economics, like “Agbioforum”, “Food Policy”, “International Journal of Hydropower and Dams”, and “Social Science and Medicine”. This is also understandable, since the majority of the published articles are about regional issues, which are multidisciplinary in nature, like health, nutrition, energy, or development in general.

Journal of Economics and Political Economy

Works of other former Soviet countries' economists showed similar trends. For instance, half of all Russian papers in economic sciences indexed in *Web of Science* between 1993 and 2010 are appeared in journals specializing in the problems of economic transition and emerging markets. With the gradual loss of interest in the post-Soviet transitions in the West a declining trend occurs in number of "transition" articles (Kirtchik, 2012). Interest of the western world to "transition issues" and to CAC region^x may also explain this publication tendency found in our study. As academia became more familiar to the region and lose its interest in transition we may expect this trend will change.

The third characteristic that is evident in the table is the absence of articles published in the top journals,^{xi} which is also somewhat unsurprising when the short history of internationalization of publications in the region is considered. These finding is also in line with studies of other former socialist countries (Kirtchik, 2012; Coupe, 2008; München, 2006).

Two other characteristics of the articles are co-authorship and the contribution of foreigners working in local institutions and/or international organizations. Co-authorship is a very common practice among CAC economists. Institution-affiliated economists in Armenia, Turkmenistan, Tajikistan and Kyrgyzstan, for example, have not even produced one single-authored article. In other countries, too, the vast majority of articles have been co-authored. In co-authored articles, a local academic usually cooperates with a foreign one. In some cases, only foreigners, who work for a local office of an international organization or a local institution, contribute in the name of one of the CAC countries. Most probably, the foreigners participate in these partnerships with their language skills and experience in publishing in international journals. Local partners are usually affiliated to post-soviet universities or international organizations which are more competitive and have closer contact to the west (Table 3, in appendix).

Other studies on post socialist countries also show similar results. For instance, Coupe (2008) shows that contribution of Ukrainian economists to economics literature is limited but improving with help of increasing number of Western educated young economists. He explains this development as result of capacity building initiatives that started after the fall of Soviet Union and largely supported by international organizations. Lack of incentives is set as a major explanation for the low performance of Ukraine educated and based economists. On the other hand, after 2001 the body of journals publishing Russian economists' works broadens remarkably with the contribution of Western trained economists employed in post-Soviet institutions. Similar results are found for Russian economists too (Kirtchik, 2012).

4. Conclusion

In the socialist era, economists, like other scientists, had limited connections to the West and their work rarely appeared in international journals due to methodological differences between the Western and the Soviet scholars in social sciences, inadequacies in English, and other legal restrictions. After the collapse of socialism, legal barriers were lifted but the new republics still needed new economists equipped with the requirements of the new economic order based on private property and market mechanisms. To this end, they reorganized their economics curricula, published new textbooks, and trained students and academics (in their home countries or in the West). In all of these efforts, unlike in the old era, the new republics cooperated closely with the international organizations.

The results of this study show that number of international publications increased gradually in CAC countries. Results also show that publications are

Journal of Economics and Political Economy

usually about regional issues and published in low impact journals. The preference of CAC economists to publish in Russian language journals suggests that language is still a barrier to publication in international journals. Finally, cooperation with Westerners and Western institutions is found to contribute positively to the publication performance of post-Soviet economists.

These results imply that following the collapse of socialism the CAC republics lifted restrictions and allowed their scientists to establish closer contacts with their Western counterparts. New education policies adopted in collaboration with international organizations helped to reform the academic environment in these countries. In this process, they developed new academics and formed new institutions that were more competitive, better equipped with the requirements of the new order, and had closer contacts with the West. All these efforts have contributed to the academic performance of these countries, particularly in the social sciences. As the numbers of new generation academics and institutions continue grow, we may expect a higher number of academic works originating from the post-Soviet republics to appear in international outlets, and, moreover, not only restricted to regional issues but also concerned about more general topics in the social sciences.

References

- Alexeev, M., Clifford G., & Leitzel, J. (1992). Economics in the former Soviet Union. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 6(2): 137–148.
- Androushchak, G., & Maria Yudkevich, M. (2012). How Post-Soviet Russian Academia Struggles with the Past. *International Higher Education*, 69, 23–23.
- Brue S. L., & MacPhee, C. R. (1995). From Marx to markets: Reform of the university economics curriculum in Russia. *Journal of Economic Education*, 26(2), 182-194. (10.1080/00220485.1995.10844870).
- Coupé, T. (2008). The visibility of Ukrainian economists 1969–2005. *The Journal of Socio-Economics*, 37(5), 2114–2125. (10.1016/j.socec.2007.06.003).
- Çokgezen, M. (2013). Publication performance of economists and economics departments in Turkey (2006–2011): An update and comparison. *Regional and Sectoral Economic Studies*, 13(3), 95-106.
- García L. L. G. (2006). Academic language barriers and language freedom. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 7(1), 61-81. (10.2167/cilp084.0).
- Kirtchik, O. (2012). Limits and strategies for the internationalization of Russian economic science: Sociological interpretation of bibliometric data. *Laboratorium: Russian Review of Social Research*, 4(1), 19–44.
- Mogilevskii, R. (2012). Trends and patterns in foreign trade of Central Asian Countries. *University of Central Asia, Graduate School of Development Institute of Public Policy and Administration, Working Paper*, No. 1.
- Munich, D. (2006). Recent Publication Productivity of Czech Economists. *Czech Journal of Economics and Finance*, 56(11–12), 522–533.
- Nixey, J. (2012). The long goodbye: Waning Russian influence in the South Caucasus and Central Asia. *Briefing Paper REP RSP BP*, 2012/03 (Chatham House)
- Pleskovic, B., Åslund, A., Bader, W., & Campbell, R. (2002). *Capacity building in economics: Education and research in transition economies*, Washington, D.C.: World Bank, Research Advisory Staff.
- Polyak, B. T. (2001). History of mathematical programming in the USSR: Analyzing the phenomenon. *Mathematical Programming*, 91(3), 1-16. (10.1007/s101070100258).
- Silova, I., & Steiner-Khamsi, G. (2008). Introduction: Unwrapping the Post-Socialist education reform package. in *How NGOs react: Globalization and education reform in the Caucasus, Central Asia, and Mongolia*, Silova, I. and G. Steiner-Khamsi (Eds.), pp. 1–42, West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press.
- Sinitsiya, O. (1999). Soviet Union and its Cultural and Professional Results for Arts and Art Libraries. *INSPEL*, 33(1), 35-42.

Appendix:

TABLE 2: *Distribution of articles by journal*

Journal	No. of Articles
Actual Problems of Economics	94
ADB Economic Paper Series	1
Agbioforum	1
Applied Economics	1
Applied Economics Letters	2
Asian Social Science	12
Atlantic Economic Journal	1
Benchmarking	1
Comparative Economic Studies	1
Computational Economics	2
Courrier des Pays de l'Est	3
Cuadernos de Economía	1
Defence and Peace Economics	1
Developing Economies	1
E a M: Ekonomie a Management	1
Eastern Economic Journal	1
Econometric Theory	1
Econometrics Journal	1
Economic Change and Restructuring	2
Economic Modelling	1
Economic Theory	2
Economic Systems	2
Economics and Human Biology	2
Economics and Sociology	1
Economics Letters	1
Economics of Transition	2
Economy of Region	1
Emerging Markets Finance and Trade	3
Emerging Markets Review	1
Empirical Economics	1
Energy Economics	1
Engineering Economics	1
Eurasian (formerly Post-Soviet) Geography and Economics	6
Europe-Asia Studies	2
Financial Review	1
Food Policy	7
Finance and Stochastics	2
Forest Policy and Economics	2
Foresight	1
Global Economic Review	1
Global Policy	1
Health Economics	1

Journal of Economics and Political Economy

Hitotsubashi Journal of Economics	3
International Journal of Business	1
International Journal of Economic Perspectives	2
International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business	1
International Journal of Hydropower and Dams	2
International Journal of Social Economics	4
International Journal of Theoretical and Applied Finance	2
International Research Journal of Finance and Economics	1
International Review of Economics and Finance	1
Jahrbucher fur Nationalökonomie und Statistik	1
Journal of Agricultural Economics	1
Journal of Asian Economics	2
Journal of Banking and Finance	5
Journal of Business Ethics	1
Journal of Common Market Studies	1
Journal of Comparative Economics	1
Journal of Economic Education	1
Journal of Economics/ Zeitschrift für Nationalökonomie	1
Journal of Finance	1
Journal of Health Economics	1
Journal of International Economic Law	1
Journal of International Marketing	1
Journal of International Trade Law and Policy	1
Journal of Mathematical Economics	2
Journal of Multinational Financial Management	1
Journal of Portfolio Management	1
Journal of Public Budgeting, Accounting and Financial Management	1
Journal of Socio-Economics	2
Mondes en Development	1
Nonlinear Analysis: Real World Applications	3
Public Choice	1
Regional and Sectoral Economic Studies	1
Research in International Business and Finance	1
Research in Transportation Economics	1
Review of International Political Economy	1
Review of Pacific Basin Financial Markets and Policies	1
Revue d'Etudes Comparatives Est-Ouest	4
Romanian Journal of Economic Forecasting	1
Social Science and Medicine	4
Space Policy	1
Studies in Economics and Finance	1
Studies on Russian Economic Development	1
Technological and Economic Development of Economy	2
Transformations in Business and Economics	1
World Development	7
World Review of Entrepreneurship, Management, and Sustainable Development	2

TABLE 3. *Number of contributors and their affiliations*

Affiliations	No. of Contributors	Affiliations	No. of Contributors
<u>KAZAKHSTAN</u>		<u>KYRGYZSTAN</u>	
Abai Kazak National Teachers' Training U.	2	Kyrgyzstan-Turkey Manas U.	2
The Ministry of Education and Science	1	National Bank of the Kyrgyz Republic	2
ACEPAS,GFA Consulting Group GmbH	1	World Bank Country Office	1
North Kazakhstan State U.	1	Kompanion Financial Group	1
Consultantesur le Kazakhstan	1	Delegation of the European Commission to the Kyrgyz Republic	1
Delegation of the European Commission to Kazakhstan	1	WHO	1
Kazpotrebsouz Karaganda Economic U.	1	National Statistical Committee	2
Kazakh-Russian International U.	1	Kyrgyz-Swiss Forestry Support Program	1
Kazakh-British Technical U.	1	Agrarian Reforms Department Ministry of Agriculture	2
L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National U.	9	Kyrgyz Res. Inst. of Obstet. / P.	1
Nazarbayev University	1	Agency for Technical Cooperation	1
Kazakh-American Free U.		International Ataturk-Alatoo U.	1
Caspian State U. of Technology and Engineering (named after S.Esenov, Aktau)	4	<u>TAJIKISTAN</u>	
Miras University	1	Ministry of Agriculture and Water Resources	1
Kazakh National Technical U.named after K. Satpaev	3	Deutsche GesellschaftfürInternationaleZusammenarbeit GmbH, Tajikistan	1
South-Kazakhstan State U. of M. Auezov	2	Centre de Recherche et d'Opinion Publique Sharq	1
Kazakhstan People's Friendship U.	1	International Economics Technological U. of Tajikistan	1
International Academy of Business	3	Central Bank of Tajikistan	1
Statistical Agency of the Rep. of Kazakhstan	3	Save the Children, US	1
Kazakhstan Scientific Research Institute of Agricultural Economics	1	Ministry of Foreign Affairs	2
Kazakh Humanitarian Juridical Innovative U.	2	<u>ARMENIA</u>	
Karaganda State U.	5	Central Bank of Armenia	1
Eurasian Development Bank	1	UNESCO Chair-Life Sciences	3
Humanitarian and Technical Academy	1	World Bank	1
Indépendant à Almaty	1	Hydroenergetica,	1

Journal of Economics and Political Economy

Inst. of Theory and Practice of Public Administration	1	Tiezerk Co Ltd	1
International A. Yasawi Kazakh-Turkish U.	4	Centre for Agribusiness and Rural Development (CARD),	1
Kazakh Humanitarian and Law U.	3	Oxfam (GB),	3
Kazakh National Agrarian U.	8	Support to Communities	1
Kazakh National Pedagogical U.	3	Inst. of Man	1
Kazakh National U. named after al-Farabi	6	American U. of Armenia	1
Kazakh State Teacher Training U.	1	Armenian Research Institute of Energy	1
Kazakh U. of Economics, Finance and International Trade, Astana	17	Rushmore U.	1
Kazakh-American U.	1	Inst. of Management and Economic Reforms	1
Kazakh-British Technical U.	7	<u>UZBEKISTAN</u>	
Kazakhstan Agrarian Policy Science Institute	1	Westminster International University in Tashkent	7
Chelyabinsk State University	1	ADB Uzbekistan Resident Mission	1
Kazakhstan Institute of Management, Economics and Strategic Research (KIMEP)	22	Institute for Forecasting and Macroeconomic Research	2
Kazakhstan Science Production Inst.	1	United Nations Development Program,	1
Kazakhstan State Agrarian U.	1	U. of World Economy and Diplomacy	3
Korkyt Ata Kyzylorda State U.	12	Tashkent State Economics U.	4
L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National U.	14	Ministry of Agriculture and Water Management	4
National Analytical Center under the Government and National Bank of Kazakhstan	1	Medecins Sans Frontieres, Aral Sea Area Program	1
National Statistical Agency	1	Central Bank of Uzbekistan	3
Pragma Corporation	5	International Center for Agricultural Research in the Dry Areas	1
S. Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical U. Astana	2	Rural Restructuring Agency	1
Suleyman Demirel U.	1	Tashkent Irrigation Institute	1
Turar Ryskulov Kazakh Economic U.	19	Uzbek Research Institute of Market Reforms of USPCA	1
U. of International Business	2	Tashkent State Agrarian U.	1
U. Turan	3	<u>AZERBAIJAN</u>	
Academy of Public Administration	1	Central Bank of the Republic Azerbaijan	1
D.Serikbayev East Kazakhstan State Technical University	1	Caspian Quality of Life Center	1
West-Kazakhstan State Medical Academy named after M. Ospanov,	2	Azerbaijan U. of Languages	1
Kazakh AblaiKhan University of	1	Institute of Human Rights	1

Journal of Economics and Political Economy

International Relations and World Languages		National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Azerbaijan	
Kainar University	1	AFB Bank	1
<u>GEORGIA</u>		Baku State U.	8
Georgian-American U.	3	Azerbaijan National Academy of Sciences	3
Georgian Technical U.	2	Baku In-service Teacher Training and Retraining Inst.	1
Tbilisi State U.	7	Qafqaz U.	2
Paata Gugushvili Inst. of Economics	1	Ministry of Economic Development	1
Georgian Center for Population Research	5	Inst. of Physics	1
American Council for International Education	1	Nakhchivan State U.	2
Engurhesi Ltd, PIU	1	Azerbaijan Inst. of Teachers	1
Curatio International Foundation	1	Academy of State Administration	1
Georgian Foundation for Strategic and International Studies	1	Demir Bank	1
Society in Support of Culture and Nature in Georgia	1	<u>TURKMENISTAN</u>	
Georgian Academy of Sciences	4	UNICEF	1
Curatio International Foundation	1	National Inst. of Statistics and Information	1
Iliia State University	2		
International Black Sea University	1		

Notes

- ⁱ For the restrictions to foreign publications and censorship in the Soviet Union see Sinitsiya (1999). For other restrictions before any contact with the western academics see Polyak (2001). Kirtchik (2012) indicates that access restriction to foreign publications are not too severe in relatively less ideological fields like mathematical economics.
- ⁱⁱ For examples of academicians who were exposed to a humiliating execution after the publication of their papers in Western journals or obstacles before going abroad for a conference see Polyak (2001)
- ⁱⁱⁱ For reform and transition performances of these countries see European Bank for reconstruction and Development's Transition Indicators available at <http://www.ebrd.com/pages/research/economics/data/macro.shtml> (accessed in January 3rd, 2014)
- ^{iv} Mogilevskii (2012) shows that Russia and other countries in the region are major trade partners of Central Asian countries.
- ^v After the independence, former soviet union states in the region gave up using Russian, official language of former order, and passed laws which granted their national languages the status of official language. These laws and complementary policies in education and other spheres of public life envisioned a gradual transition away from Russian. Even though, Russian language has lost considerable ground as a result of these policies, it is still important and 'lingua franca' of the region (Nixey, 2012)
- ^{vi} Unless otherwise mentioned, all information about economics education in the Soviet era is based on Alexeev, Gaddy, and Leitzel (1992).
- ^{vii} See also Brue and MacPhee (1995)
- ^{viii} Leonid Kantorovich shared the Nobel Prize in Economic Sciences with Tjalling Koopmans in 1975.
- ^{ix} Even if the 52 articles published in APE are ignored, the number is still above 20 (see below).
- ^x Because of geographic proximity, economic opportunities, ethnic and cultural ties, former socialist countries in Europe attracted earlier attention of the Western academics. More resource devoted to research these countries than CAC and academic information about CAC region remained relatively weaker.
- ^{xi} 'Top Journals' refer to the journals on whose high quality there is a broad consensus, like "Econometrica", "Quarterly Journal of Economics", "Review of Economic Studies", "Journal of Political Economy", "Journal of Finance", "Journal of Monetary Economics", "American Economic Review", "Journal of Economic Theory", "Journal of Econometrics", "Games and Economic Behavior", "Review of Economics and Statistics", "Journal of Economic Perspectives", "Journal of Economic Theory" and "Economic Journal" (Çokgezen, 2013).



Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0>).

